Architectural Review Board Special Called Meeting

December 28, 2022 – 5:30 p.m.
Council Auditorium, City Hall
103 North Perry Street

ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD MEMBERS

Ms. Elizabeth Brown, Chairman

Ms. Katie Williams, Vice-Chairman

Ms. Kahlia Bell

Mr. Cedric Campbell

Mr. Jon Hayden

Mr. Jake Johnson

Ms. Hillary Morgan

Mr. Barry G. Robinson

LAND USE DIVISION Thomas M. Tyson, Jr. Executive Secretary

- I. Approval of the Actions from the October 25, 2022, meeting
- II. Administrative Actions
- **III.** Full Review Items

<u>Item</u>	<u>Petitioner</u>	Historic District	Location
1.	Jane Marshall	Garden District	331 Winthrop Court
2.	Chip Carden	Cottage Hill	445 Herron Street
3.	Johnny Raines	Cottage Hill	103 N. Goldthwaite
4.	Patrick Cardullo	Capitol Heights	1903 Madison Avenue
5.	Sandra Nickel	Garden District	1200 S. Lawrence Street
6.	April Hampton	Old Cloverdale	735 E. Fairview Avenue

IV. Other Business

The next meeting of the Architectural Review Board will be on Tuesday, January 24, 2023 at 5:30 p.m.

II. Administrative Actions

Date	Address	District	Request/Violation	Action
10/14/2022	1121 S. McDonough	Garden	Front door replacement, no response to letter or restoration of door	Paperwork filed in Municipal Court
10/14/2022	735 E. Fairview	Cloverdale	Front yard parking area, ARB requested a plan, no response from owner with deadlines provided	Paperwork filed in Municipal Court
10/14/2022	640 Plymouth	Cloverdale Idlewild	Vinyl windows still in place	Paperwork filed in Municipal Court
10/14/2022	126 N Lewis	St Charles- Capitol Heights	Tree removals, owner refuses to make application stating no proof in spite of staff photos/UF inspection	Paperwork filed in Municipal Court
10/14/2022	2305 St Charles	St Charles- Capitol Heights	Parking area not executed as approved, area too large, no screening. No response from owner	Paperwork filed in Municipal Court
10/14/2022	2000 Winona	St Charles- Capitol Heights	Doors cut in place of windows, no permits no response from owner	Paperwork filed in Municipal Court
10/14/2022	1414 S Hull St	Garden	Church of Ascension sent letter re: 6 month deadline after demo to submit landscape plan	January 1 deadline
10/26/2022	420 S Highland Court	South Highland Court	Front door and some porch columns replaced	No response to 30 day letter, 15 day letter sent
11/1/2022	101 S. Capitol Pkwy	Capitol Parkway	Rear yard fence and driveway replacement	Admin approval
11/3/2022	694 Cloverdale	Cloverdale	After speaking with owner and contractor, no further contact.	30 day letter

III. Full Review of Items

1. PRESENTED BY: Jane Marshall

SUBJECT: Request for approval of a front door accent color for the property located at 331 Winthrop Court (Garden District).

REMARKS: Request for approval of the use of Benjamin Moore HC-156 "Van Deusen Blue" on the front door and porch floor (not visible). The color has been selected to accent #25 (light blue) as the main body color and #24 (white) on the trim. Sample to be provided at meeting.

STANDARD OF REVIEW: Section 15-127 of the City Code states that "the board shall approve an application and issue a certificate of appropriateness if it finds that the proposed change, erection or demolition conforms to the general design standards established by the board, is compatible with the character of the historic property or historic district and does not materially impair the architectural or historic value of the historic property or historic district."

DEPARTMENT COMMENTS

Zoning: R75-s

• No objection used with proposed paint scheme.

COMMENT	.`S		
ACTION			

2. PRESENTED BY: Chip Carden

SUBJECT: Request for approval of a new ID sign for the property located at 445 Herron Street (Cottage Hill).

REMARKS: The petitioner is requesting permission to install a monument sign, approximately 4' tall and 7.5' wide at the corner of the property at Herron and Whitman Streets. The monument itself is 29.2 SF, while the sign face is approximately 20 SF (meets guidelines). The lettering will be flush mounted, with external LED solar lights proposed.

STANDARD OF REVIEW: Section 15-127 of the City Code states that "the board shall approve an application and issue a certificate of appropriateness if it finds that the proposed change, erection or demolition conforms to the general design standards established by the board, is compatible with the character of the historic property or historic district and does not materially impair the architectural or historic value of the historic property or historic district."

DEPARTMENT COMMENTS

Zoning: T4-R

- One street view image shows the previous ID sign; a second shows a sign on a 4'x8' board in approximately the same location and orientation as the proposed sign. The monument is similarly sized, but will be set on the ground.
- The actual sign face is about 20SF, meets lighting guidelines, and with landscaping will only further screen the view of the parking lot. No objection.

COMMENTS	S		
ACTION			

3. PRESENTED BY: Johnny Raines

SUBJECT: Request for approval of revisions to a previously approved plan for the property located at 103 N. Goldthwaite (Cottage Hill).

REMARKS: The revised petition eliminates the previously proposed outbuilding that was to house an elevator, with connecting walkways to the rear of the house. The rear elevation has been modified to reflect this change, with the addition of ramps, stairs, and porches. All windows in the house are proposed to be replaced (some are missing), 1:1 double paned aluminum clad windows (or to match window replacing if different). Window replacement will only be sashes unless frames are damaged beyond repair. Smooth cementitious siding is proposed where illustrated on the rear elevation. Salvaged brick will be used for new walls and piers visible from Martha Street, brick wall to be rebuilt along Martha Street. Wall and fencing with gates was previously approved. All finishes will be painted to match the existing.

The petition in May 2021 was as follows, all was approved subject to documentation being submitted on the outbuilding, which was received prior to demolition:

- Remove three trees, including an oak tree growing in the retaining wall contributing to its failure, another growing too close to the house, and a dying tree in the right of way. To be replaced with a magnolia and crepe myrtles with a 2.5" minimum diameter, to be planted in the next planting season.
- Demolish the two-story carriage house which is structurally compromised, replaced with a new two and a half story outbuilding that will provide elevator access to the 2nd floor of the main dwelling. North and west elevations have no openings; east elevation connects to main dwelling via an open breezeway. Entry level at grade will be brick veneered with salvaged brick from demo (perimeter wall to be rebuilt with salvage brick with gate and fence as illustrated); cemetitious siding with 6" reveal and synthetic stucco veneer painted limestone to match the existing house; asphalt architectural shingle in light gray to match the existing house; trim on addition to be wood, columns and rails on connector PVC; standing seam metal canopy over entrance; clad windows with PVC trim.
- Modifications to the west elevation of the main dwelling to tie it to the addition as illustrated. The west wall is in large part missing. Cemetitious siding is proposed on the north wing and center bay, with synthetic stucco on south wing.
- Work on main house, except for west elevation, will be repairs.

This petition is to extend the approval for the previously approved work, with the proposed modifications to this plan.

STANDARD OF REVIEW: Section 15-127 of the City Code states that "the board shall approve an application and issue a certificate of appropriateness if it finds that the proposed change, erection or demolition conforms to the general design standards established by the board, is compatible with the character of the historic property or historic district and does not materially impair the architectural or historic value of the historic property or historic district."

DEPARTMENT COMMENTS

Zoning: T/ P

Zoning.	1 - N
•	No objection.
C	COMMENTS
	CTION

4. PRESENTED BY: Patrick Cardullo

SUBJECT: Request for approval of door awnings for the property located at 1903 Madison Avenue (Capitol Heights).

REMARKS: The petitioner is requesting permission to install fabric awnings over the two pairs of French door on the front elevation of this house. The awnings will be comprised of aluminum frames in the style illustrated with the fabric options illustrated. The awning will be mounted above the fanlight of the French door to protect the fanlight and to divert more water away from the door to reduce splashback on the bottom of the door, which is failing. Owner is open to other fabric colors.

STANDARD OF REVIEW: Section 15-127 of the City Code states that "the board shall approve an application and issue a certificate of appropriateness if it finds that the proposed change, erection or demolition conforms to the general design standards established by the board, is compatible with the character of the historic property or historic district and does not materially impair the architectural or historic value of the historic property or historic district."

DEPARTMENT COMMENTS

Zoning: R-60-s

- The owner indicated he would also be open to other suggestions for addressing his water issue. The doors face south.
- This is an easily reversible change, no objection.

COMMENTS		
ACTION		

5. PRESENTED BY: Sandra Nickel

SUBJECT: Request for approval of porch flooring for the property located at 1200 South Lawrence Street (Garden District).

REMARKS: The petitioner is requesting permission to replace the deteriorated tongue and groove hardwood porch flooring with tongue and groove cementitious hardboard. The flooring will be Deckorators, kettle color. A sample will be provided by the petitioner at the meeting.

STANDARD OF REVIEW: Section 15-127 of the City Code states that "the board shall approve an application and issue a certificate of appropriateness if it finds that the proposed change, erection or demolition conforms to the general design standards established by the board, is compatible with the character of the historic property or historic district and does not materially impair the architectural or historic value of the historic property or historic district."

DEPARTMENT COMMENTS

Zoning:	R-60-d
•	No objection.
C	OMMENTS
A	CTION

6. PRESENTED BY: April Hampton

SUBJECT: Request for approval after the fact of a parking pad for the property located at 735 E. Fairview Avenue (Cloverdale). VIOLATION

REMARKS: The petitioner is requesting permission to retain an installed, crushed run parking pad in the front yard of 735 E. Fairview Ave. The parking pad would be reduced in size to 20' x 20'. There is brown rubber/metal edging to contain the gravel between this yard and the neighbor. There is a gravel area widening the driveway that is 4' wide by 65' long. Petitioner states it is needed to improve drainage near the garage area. The petitioner requests to retain the existing concrete pads and would like to stain them a dark brown color for a variation of color and appearance between the concrete and gravel that already exists. There is no on street parking available on Fairview.

STANDARD OF REVIEW: Section 15-127 of the City Code states that "the board shall approve an application and issue a certificate of appropriateness if it finds that the proposed change, erection or demolition conforms to the general design standards established by the board, is compatible with the character of the historic property or historic district and does not materially impair the architectural or historic value of the historic property or historic district."

DEPARTMENT COMMENTS

Zoning: R-60-d

- The question for the Board with violations is always "Would we have approved this project as presented if the petitioner had asked first?" Just because it is there doesn't mean it has to stay there as is.
- The situation is always evaluated on a case by case basis as well as considering whether a differently executed plan would yield a similar result. This property has a driveway that goes behind the house to a garage, which offers some off street parking.
- The parking area has been pulled over to be out of the line of sight of the front door.
- Gravel should be clearly contained so it cannot spill into the street.
- When parking areas have been approved, they had to be able to provide enough screening from the street to soften the view of the parking area from the street. Parking area, if approved, should have a screen planted along the Fairview edge of the property and not present a continuous sea of gravel on the east half of the front lawn to the front property line. That will still afford the opportunity to not have to back out onto Fairview. Installed landscaping does not appear to meet the landscaping guidelines of evergreen shrubs, 18" high at installation, spaced 36" on center.

COMMEN	TS		
ACTION _			